

# Feedback on the Commission Initiative "Brain drain – mitigating challenges associated with population decline (communication)"

The European legislation of mutual recognition of diplomas in the healthcare field has been designed in the late sixties originally with rather homogenous healthcare systems of six countries. What looked like a nice idea in a pure and perfect market has, and still is, in reality facilitated the brain drain between EU member states on many occasions, notably following the 2000s enlargement. The only policies that have been somehow able to counteract this brain drain were those that trained more healthcare professionals. Despite several EU funded research in this field, the lack of accurate data makes in any case difficult to provide evidence on the efficiency of policies.

The brain drain within countries is also important in the healthcare field for the same reason as for the other sectors of the economy. But this brain drain in the healthcare sector might certainly contribute significantly to migration from rural zones to cities. Several policies are in place in European countries and regions to find solutions. EU funded currently running projects on medical deserts might give soon a good overview of those existing policies and maybe some evidence that could help countries and regions to find solutions.

#### \*\*\*\*\*\*

HOPE, the European Hospital and Healthcare Federation, is a European non-profit organisation, created in 1966. HOPE represents national public and private hospitals associations and hospitals owners either federations of local and regional authorities or national health services. Today, HOPE is made up of 36 organisations coming from the 27 Member States of the European Union, as well as from the United Kingdom, Switzerland and Serbia as observer members. HOPE mission is to promote improvements in the health of citizens throughout Europe, high standard of hospital care and to foster efficiency with humanity in the organisation and operation of hospital and healthcare services.

# Brain drain – mitigating challenges associated with population decline (communication)

Fields marked with \* are mandatory.

#### Introduction

#### **Objective of the consultation**

In line with its Work Programme for 2022, the Commission is preparing a Communication on brain drain and population decline. This deliverable will notably look into the different drivers of brain drain, its short- and long-term consequences, as well as potential solutions to stop or even reverse the phenomenon.

The International Labour Organisation defines "Brain Drain" as the negative effects associated with the emigration of highly qualified people whose skills are scarce in their country of origin. Those negative effects, which can manifest at a national or regional scale, could be of macroeconomic nature, where there is a net outflow of qualified people with an impact on growth potential, or of a microeconomic nature, where migration leads to bottlenecks and skills mismatches in specific sectors.

Brain drain is a problem that many parts of the EU have experienced including within the same Member State.

This public consultation aims to understand the scale of the phenomenon at EU and regional levels, the perception of the causes of brain drain, the socio-economic consequences of the brain drain (including by economic sector and job category), as well as the nature of policy levers and their governance to retain, attract or re-attract skilled workers. The consultation will also provide the opportunity to examine in more detail the subnational and interregional dynamics of brain drain.

#### Target group

This consultation is open to all citizens and stakeholders. Contributions are particularly sought from stakeholders who may have first-hand experience with the phenomenon, including citizens, national, regional and local authorities in EU Member States; academia, trade, business and professional associations, businesses – including small and medium sized enterprises – trade unions, non-governmental organisations.

#### Guidance

The estimated time to reply to this questionnaire is approximately 20 minutes.

For the purposes of this consultation, here are some important definitions:

- Brain drain: The loss suffered by a country or region as a result of the emigration of a (highly) qualified person.
- Push-pull factor: Factors which initiate and influence the decision to migrate, either by attracting (highly) qualified persons to another country (pull factors) or by impelling or stimulating emigration (push factors).

For the purposes of this public consultation, note that brain drain may be both interregional and international:

- Interregional brain drain is when a (highly) qualified person moves from one region to another region within their country.
- International brain drain is when a (highly) qualified person moves from one country to another country (within and outside the EU).

- \*1 Language of my contribution
  - Bulgarian
  - Croatian
  - Czech
  - Danish
  - Dutch
  - English
  - Estonian
  - Finnish
  - French
  - German
  - Greek
  - Hungarian
  - Irish
  - Italian
  - Latvian
  - Lithuanian
  - Maltese
  - Polish
  - Portuguese
  - Romanian
  - Slovak
  - Slovenian
  - Spanish
  - Swedish
- \*2 I am giving my contribution as
  - Academic/research institution
  - Business association
  - Company/business organisation
  - Consumer organisation
  - EU citizen
  - Environmental organisation

- Non-EU citizen
- Non-governmental organisation (NGO)
- Public authority
- Trade union
- Other

#### \*3 First name

#### \*4 Surname

GAREL

# \*5 Email (this won't be published)

sg@hope.be

# \*9 Country of origin

Please add your country of origin, or that of your organisation.

$\bigcirc$	Afghanistan	0	Djibouti	0	Libya	$\bigcirc$	Saint Martin
$\bigcirc$	Åland Islands	0	Dominica	$\bigcirc$	Liechtenstein	$\bigcirc$	Saint Pierre and
							Miquelon
$\bigcirc$	Albania	$\bigcirc$	Dominican	0	Lithuania	۲	Saint Vincent
			Republic				and the
							Grenadines
$\bigcirc$	Algeria	0	Ecuador	0	Luxembourg	$\bigcirc$	Samoa
$\bigcirc$	American Samoa	$\bigcirc$	Egypt	0	Macau	۲	San Marino
$\bigcirc$	Andorra	۲	El Salvador	$\bigcirc$	Madagascar	0	São Tomé and
							Príncipe
$\bigcirc$	Angola	۲	Equatorial Guinea	a	Malawi	$\bigcirc$	Saudi Arabia
$\bigcirc$	Anguilla	$\bigcirc$	Eritrea	0	Malaysia	۲	Senegal
$\bigcirc$	Antarctica	۲	Estonia	$\bigcirc$	Maldives	0	Serbia
$\bigcirc$	Antigua and	0	Eswatini	۲	Mali	$\bigcirc$	Seychelles
	Barbuda						
$\bigcirc$	Argentina	۲	Ethiopia	$\bigcirc$	Malta	0	Sierra Leone
$\bigcirc$	Armenia	0	Falkland Islands	$\bigcirc$	Marshall Islands	$\bigcirc$	Singapore
$\bigcirc$	Aruba	۲	Faroe Islands	$\bigcirc$	Martinique	$\bigcirc$	Sint Maarten

Australia	Fiji	Mauritania	Slovakia
Austria	Finland	Mauritius	Slovenia
Azerbaijan	France	Mayotte	Solomon Islands
Bahamas	French Guiana	Mexico	Somalia
Bahrain	French Polynesi	a <sup>©</sup> Micronesia	South Africa
Bangladesh	French Southerr	n 🤍 Moldova	South Georgia
	and Antarctic		and the South
	Lands		Sandwich
			Islands
Barbados	Gabon	Monaco	South Korea
Belarus	Georgia	Mongolia	South Sudan
Belgium	Germany	Montenegro	Spain
Belize	Ghana	Montserrat	Sri Lanka
Benin	Gibraltar	Morocco	Sudan
Bermuda	Greece	Mozambique	Suriname
Bhutan	Greenland	Myanmar/Burma	Svalbard and
			Jan Mayen
Bolivia	Grenada	Namibia	Sweden
Bonaire Saint	Guadeloupe	Nauru	Switzerland
Eustatius and			
Saba			-
Bosnia and	Guam	Nepal	Syria
Herzegovina	0		
Botswana	Guatemala	Netherlands	Taiwan
Bouvet Island	Guernsey	New Caledonia	Tajikistan
Brazil	Guinea	New Zealand	Tanzania
British Indian	Guinea-Bissau	Nicaragua	Thailand
Ocean Territory	-	-	-
British Virgin	Guyana	Niger	The Gambia
Islands			
Brunei	Haiti	Nigeria	Timor-Leste
Bulgaria	Heard Island and	d <sup>©</sup> Niue	Togo
	McDonald Island	ls	
Burkina Faso	Honduras	Norfolk Island	Tokelau

Burundi	Hong Kong	Northern Tonga
Cambodia	Hungary	Mariana Islands North Korea Trinidad and Tobago
Cameroon	Iceland	North Macedonia Tunisia
Canada	India	Norway Turkey
Cape Verde	Indonesia	Oman Turkmenistan
Cayman Islands	Iran	Pakistan Turks and
<b>,</b>		Caicos Islands
Central African Republic	Iraq	Palau Tuvalu
Chad	Ireland	Palestine Uganda
© Chile	Isle of Man	Panama <sup>©</sup> Ukraine
China		Papua New United Arab
Grinia	151 del	Guinea Emirates
Christmas Island	Italy	Paraguay Onited Kingdom
<ul> <li>Clipperton</li> </ul>	Jamaica	Peru  United States
<ul> <li>Cocos (Keeling)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Japan</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Philippines</li> <li>United States</li> </ul>
Islands	Japan	Minor Outlying
Isianas		Islands
Colombia	Jersey	Pitcairn Islands Uruguay
Comoros	Jordan	Poland US Virgin Islands
Congo	Kazakhstan	Portugal Uzbekistan
Cook Islands	Kenya	Puerto Rico Vanuatu
Costa Rica	<ul> <li>Kiribati</li> </ul>	© Qatar © Vatican City
Côte d'Ivoire	Kosovo	Réunion Venezuela
Croatia	Kuwait	Romania Vietnam
Cuba	Kyrgyzstan	Russia Wallis and
		Futuna
Curaçao	Laos	Rwanda Western Sahara
Cyprus	Latvia	Saint Barthélemy Vemen
Czechia	Lebanon	Saint Helena Zambia
		Ascension and
		Tristan da Cunha

Democratic	Lesotho	Saint Kitts and	Zimbabwe
Republic of the	•	Nevis	
Congo			
Denmark	Liberia	Saint Lucia	
*12 Organisation nam	ne		
255 character(s) maximun	7		
European Hospital and	Healthcare Federation		

#### \*13 Postal address of the organisation (including postal code)

avenue Marnix 30 1000 Bruxelles Belgium

#### \*14 Organisation size

- Micro (1 to 9 employees)
- Small (10 to 49 employees)
- Medium (50 to 249 employees)
- Large (250 or more)

#### 15 Transparency register number

#### 255 character(s) maximum

Check if your organisation is on the transparency register. It's a voluntary database for organisations seeking to influence EU decision-making.

73872883198-91

The Commission will publish all contributions to this public consultation. You can choose whether you would prefer to have your details published or to remain anonymous when your contribution is published. Fo r the purpose of transparency, the type of respondent (for example, 'business association, 'consumer association', 'EU citizen') country of origin, organisation name and size, and its transparency register number, are always published. Your e-mail address will never be published. Opt in to select the privacy option that best suits you. Privacy options default based on the type of respondent selected

#### \*17 Contribution publication privacy settings

The Commission will publish the responses to this public consultation. You can choose whether you would like your details to be made public or to remain anonymous.

## Anonymous

Only organisation details are published: The type of respondent that you responded to this consultation as, the name of the organisation on whose behalf you reply as well as its transparency number, its size, its country of origin and your contribution will be published as received. Your name will not be published. Please do not include any personal data in the contribution itself if you want to remain anonymous.

# Public

Organisation details and respondent details are published: The type of respondent that you responded to this consultation as, the name of the organisation on whose behalf you reply as well as its transparency number, its size, its country of origin and your contribution will be published. Your name will also be published.

I agree with the personal data protection provisions

## Questionnaire

# Replying as an entity or in your professional capacity

43 Is your organisation located in:

- A city
- A suburban area
- A rural area

44 The Commission has preliminarily identified some factors, which initiate and influence the decision to migrate by impelling or stimulating the decision to move to another country or region ("push" factors). How important do you perceive these as being in promoting brain drain from one region to another region within a country (interregional brain drain)?

	Very important	Rather important	Neither important nor unimportant	Rather not important	Not important at all
a. Lack of employment, career or business opportunities in the region of origin	0	۲	O	0	0

b. Lack of educational opportunities and/or investments in education and training in the region of origin	©	۲	0	0	0
c. Lack of suitable facilities for research and development in the region of origin	0	۲	O	0	©
d. Unfavourable local political climate in the region of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
e. Ageing population in the region of origin	0	۲	O	0	0
f. Unfavourable local social climate in the region of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
g. Poor transport connections to place of employment or education in the region of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
h. Lack of early childcare or schools in the region of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
i. Lack of healthcare and other social services in the region of origin		۲	0	0	0
j. A salary gap between the region of origin and the region of destination	0	۲	0	0	0
k. Other (please specify below)	0	۲	0	0	0

#### 45 If you selected "Other", please specify:

250 character(s) maximum

46 The Commission has preliminarily identified some factors, which initiate and influence the decision to migrate by impelling or stimulating the decision to move to another country or region ("push" factors). How important do you perceive these as being in promoting brain drain from one country to another country, both within the EU and internationally (international brain drain)?

	Very important	Rather important	Neither important nor unimportant	Rather not important	Not important at all
--	-------------------	---------------------	--	----------------------------	----------------------------

a. Lack of employment, career or business opportunities in the country of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
<ul> <li>b. Lack of educational</li> <li>opportunities and/or investments</li> <li>in education and training in the</li> <li>country of origin</li> </ul>	O	۲	0	O	O
c. Lack of suitable facilities for research and development in the country of origin		0	۲	0	0
d. Unfavourable local political climate in the country of origin	0	0	۲	0	0
e. Ageing population in the country of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
f. Unfavourable local social climate in the country of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
<ul> <li>g. Poor transport connections to</li> <li>place of employment or education</li> <li>in the country of origin</li> </ul>		۲	0	0	0
h. Lack of early childcare or schools in the country of origin	0	۲	0	0	0
i. Lack of healthcare and other social services in the country of origin		۲	0	0	0
j. A salary gap between the country of origin and the country of destination	0	۲	0	0	0
k. Other (please specify below)	0	0	0	0	0

48 The Commission has preliminarily identified some factors which initiate and influence the decision to migrate by attracting individuals to another country or region (known as "pull" factors). How important do you perceive these as being in promoting brain drain from one region to another region within a country (interregional brain drain)?

	Very important	Rather important	Neither important nor unimportant	Rather not important	Not important at all
a. Better labour market conditions	0	۲	0	0	0
b. Better institutional environment and stability	0	۲	0	0	0

c. Better education, training and research institutions	0	۲	0	0	0
d. Better political climate	0	۲	0	0	0
e. Better social climate	0	۲	O	0	0
f. The location of relatives /friends	0	۲	0	0	0
g. Policies favouring immigration/moving	0	۲	0	0	0
h. Geographic proximity	0	۲	0	0	0
i. Linguistic/cultural similarities	0	۲	0	0	0
j. More advantageous taxation system	0	۲	0	0	0
k. Better business environment	0	0	0	۲	0
I. Better provision of health and social services	0	۲	0	0	0
m. Better access to public funding (including EU funding)	0	۲	0	0	0
n. Other (please specify below)	0	0	0	0	0

50 The Commission has preliminarily identified some factors which initiate and influence the decision to migrate by attracting individuals to another country or region (known as "pull" factors). How important do you perceive these as being in promoting brain drain from one country to another country, both within the EU and internationally (international brain drain)?

	Very important	Rather important	Neither important nor unimportant	Rather not important	Not important at all
a. Better labour market conditions	0	۲	0	0	0
b. Better institutional environment and stability	0	۲	0	0	0
c. Better education, training and research institutions	0	۲	۲	0	۲
d. Better political climate	0	۲	0	0	0
e. Better social climate	0	۲	0	0	0

f. The location of relatives /friends	0	۲	0	0	۲
g. Policies favouring immigration/moving	0	۲	0	0	0
h. Geographic proximity	0	۲	0	0	0
i. Linguistic/cultural similarities	0	۲	O	0	0
j. More advantageous taxation system	O	۲	0	O	0
k. Better business environment	0	0	۲	0	0
I. Better provision of health and social services	0	۲	0	0	0
m. Better access to public funding (including EU funding)	0	۲	0	0	0
n. Other (please specify below)	0	0	0	0	0

# 52 Do you agree with the following statements?

	Strongly agree	Agree	Agree somewhat	Neutral	Disagree somewhat	Disagree	Strongly disagree
a. My organisation/job sector is sensitive to the effects of brain drain	۲	0	0	0	۲	0	O
b. My organisation is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from non-EU countries	۲	0	0	۲	0	0	O
c. My organisation is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from other EU countries	۲	O	O	O	0	0	0
d. My organisation is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from other regions in my country of organisation	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0
e. The region where my organisation is located is able to attract researchers and graduates from non-EU countries	۲	0	0	O	0	0	0
f. The region where my organisation is located is able to attract researchers and graduates from other EU countries	۲	0	0	O	0	0	0
g. The region where my organisation is located is able to attract researchers and graduates from higher education from other regions in my country of organisation	۲	O	0	0	0	0	0
h. The region where my organisation is located is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from non-EU countries	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0
i. The region where my organisation is located is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from other EU countries	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0
j. The region where my organisation is located is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from other regions in my country	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0
k. Decision-makers in the region where my organisation is located are aware of the problem of brain drain	۲	۲	O	۲	0	O	O

I. Decision-makers in the region where my organisation is located should be doing more to address brain drain	۲	0			0	$\odot$	
---	---	---	--	--	---	---------	--

# 53 Do you agree with the following statements?

	Strongly agree	Agree	Agree somewhat	Neutral	Disagree somewhat	Disagree	Strongly disagree
a. The country where my organisation is located is able to attract researchers and graduates from higher education from non-EU countries	۲	0	0	0	O	0	0
<ul> <li>b. The country where my organisation is located is able to attract researchers and graduates from higher education from other EU countries</li> </ul>	۲	O	0	O	O	0	0
c. The country where my organisation is located is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from non-EU countries	۲	0	0	O	0	0	0
d. The country where my organisation is located is attractive to tertiary educated individuals from other EU countries	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0
e. Decision-makers in the country where my organisation is located are aware of the problem of brain drain	۲	0	O	۲	0	0	0
f. Decision-makers in the country where my organisation is located should be doing more to address brain drain	۲	0	0	0	0	0	0

54 Having answered the previous questions, do you agree with the following statement: the region of my organisation experiences brain drain?

- Yes
- No
- Unsure

55 If you answered "Yes", how long do you think your region of organisation has been experiencing brain drain?

- 0 5 years
- 5 10 years
- 10 15 years
- More than 15 years

56 Having answered the previous questions, do you agree with the following statement: the country of my organisation experiences brain drain?

- Yes
- No
- Unsure

57 If you answered "Yes", how long do you think your country of organisation has been experiencing brain drain?

- 0 5 years
- 5 10 years
- 10 15 years
- More than 15 years

58 If you selected "Yes" to question 54, which economic sectors do you think are most affected by brain drain in your region of organisation (select up to 3 each):

at most 3 answered row(s)

	Region
Arts, entertainment and recreation	
Accommodation and food service activities	
Manufacturing	
Wholesale and retail trade	
Human health and social work activities	<b>V</b>

Information and communication	
Transportation and storage	
Administrative and support service activities	
Construction	
Education	
Finance and insurance activities	
Real estate activities	
Public administration and defence	
Professional, scientific and technical activities	
Other (please specify below)	

60 If you selected "Yes" to question 56, which economic sectors do you think are most affected by brain drain in your country of organisation (select up to 3 each):

at most 3 answered row(s)

	Country
Arts, entertainment and recreation	
Accommodation and food service activities	
Manufacturing	
Wholesale and retail trade	
Human health and social work activities	
Information and communication	
Transportation and storage	
Administrative and support service activities	
Construction	
Education	
Finance and insurance activities	
Real estate activities	
Public administration and defence	
Professional, scientific and technical activities	
Other (please specify below)	

62 Do you consider your region of organisation as being affected by demographic ageing or loss of population?

Yes

No

63 Do you consider your country of organisation as being affected by demographic ageing or loss of population?

Yes

No

64 Are you aware of any policy measure/programme/strategy, either on an EU, national, regional, or local level, implemented to address brain drain?

Yes

No

66 Various policies can be used to retain, attract or re-attract competent individuals in the country or region of origin. How effective do you see the following policies as being in countering brain drain?

	Very effective	Somewhat effective	Neutral	Somewhat ineffective	Very ineffective
a. Tax cuts	0	۲	0	۲	0
b. Research grants	0	۲	0	0	0
c. Education and skills support	0	۲	0	۲	0
d. More job opportunities	0	۲	0	۲	0
e. Business and entrepreneurship support	0	0	0	0	۲
f. Counselling services for assistance with return	0	0	0	۲	۲
g. Recognition of academic diplomas and professional /vocational qualifications and skills validation	0	0	0	0	۲
h. Increased economic specialisation	0	0	0	۲	۲
<ul> <li>i. Enhanced cooperation &amp; synergies between universities and business</li> </ul>	0	0	O	0	۲
j. Improving rule of law	0	0	0	0	۲

k. Promotion of gender equality and inclusion		0		0	۲
I. Better provision of health and social services	O	O		۲	O
m. Improved broadband and 5g internet access	0	0	۲	0	۲
n. Enhanced teleworking	0	0	0	0	۲
o. Other (Please specify below)	0	0		0	0

#### Contact

REGIO-BRAIN-DRAIN@ec.europa.eu